The MBBS Professionalism in Practice Programme: Assessment and Feedback

Julie Chen MD, FCFPC
Bau Institute of Medical and Health Sciences Education &
Department of Family Medicine and Primary Care
The University of Hong Kong
CETL Join-the-Conversation (4):
Assessment and Feedback in Experiential Learning
June 8, 2016
Overview

• **The context** What is professionalism? Why is it important? How can it be learned?

• **The experience** of learning professionalism through attachment with a family doctor

• **The assessment** of understanding and attitudes/behaviours

• **The feedback** from preceptors to students
What is professionalism?
What is professionalism?

- Competence
- Humanism
- Accountability
- Altruism

Ethical and Legal Understanding
Skills (Communication, Reasoning)
Knowledge (Content of Medicine)

Arnold and Stern (2006)
What is professionalism?

“a set of values, behaviours, and relationships that underpins the trust the public has in doctors”

*doing the right thing in the right way for the right reasons*

Royal College of Physicians of London (2005)
Why is it important?

**Annals of Internal Medicine**

Plagiarism in Residency Application Essays

Scott Segal, MD, MHCM; Brian J. Gelfand, MD; Shelley Hurwitz, PhD; Lori Berkowitz, MD; Stanley W. Ashley, MD; Eric S. Nadel, MD; and Joel T. Katz, MD

**ACADEMIC MEDICINE**

Unprofessional Behavior in Medical School Is Associated with Subsequent Disciplinary Action by a State Medical Board

Maxine A. Papadakis, MD, Carol S. Hodgson, PhD, Arianne Teherani, PhD, and Neal D. Kohatsu, MD, MPH
How is professionalism learned?

Transition from medical student to doctor requires:

• **Scientific knowledge**\(^1\)
• **Clinical skills**\(^1\)
• **Values, attitude and professional character**\(^1\)
  – Learning strategy: setting expectations, providing experiences and evaluating outcomes
  – E.g: role modeling\(^{2,3,4}\)
  – E.g: medical humanities\(^{4,5,6}\)

3. Loh K-Y, et al Medical Education. 2010
How is professionalism learned?

You don’t have to “teach” professionalism
But you could:

– create a professional **educational culture**
– act as excellent **role models**
– help students **reflect** on professionalism
– develop it through **explicit relevant activities**
– monitor their behaviours, give feedback on it and tell them it is professionalism
– Patients, patients, patients!
The Experience (1):
Professionalism in Practice

- 3 year *longitudinal programme* built on early clinical contact with the same primary care preceptor
- **Focus on different aspects of professionalism**
  - Year 1 *humanism*
  - Year 2 responsibility and altruism
  - Year 3 competence
## The Experience (2)
### Year 1 Overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning outcome</th>
<th>Learning activity</th>
<th>Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discuss</strong> the idea of what it means to be a doctor</td>
<td>Preceptor attachment (interview preceptor) Debriefing</td>
<td>Reflective essay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reflect upon</strong> the various professional roles and responsibilities of a primary care doctor</td>
<td>Seminar Preceptor attachment (observe/discuss with preceptor) Debriefing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Articulate</strong> a personal oath of professionalism that befits a Year 1 medical student</td>
<td>Preceptor attachment Debriefing</td>
<td>Personal oath</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Demonstrate</strong> professional attitudes and behaviour</td>
<td>Preceptor attachment</td>
<td>Demonstration of professional attributes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### MBBS Year I
Professionalism in Practice Programme
Professionalism Assessment by Preceptor

Student Name: ___________________________  Year of Study: ________

Date of Attendance: ___________________________

Please give a rating based on how well the student met expectations for his/her year of study:

1 = unacceptable  2 = below expectations  3 = met expectations  4 = exceeded expectations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Punctuality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Appropriate dress and appearance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Showed interest, engaged</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Well prepared and took initiative for own learning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Sought feedback or advice for self-improvement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Communicated with appropriate language and behaviour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Showed respect for preceptor, patients and clinic staff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Overall impression**

Additional comments:
Assessment – attitude and behaviour (2)

- Excellence
- Improvement of quality

Year 1 student
- Seeks feedback and advice for self improvement

Arnold and Stern (2006)
Assessment – attitude and behaviour (3)

- Respect
- Compassion
- Empathy

Year 1 student
- Appropriate dress
- Shows respect for preceptor, patients and clinic staff

Arnold and Stern (2006)
Assessment – attitude and behaviour (4)

- Responsibility
- Duty
- Commitment
- Quality

Year 1 student
- Punctuality
- Well prepared and takes initiative for own learning

Arnold and Stern (2006)
Assessment and Feedback

“Asks practical & intuitive questions; Conscientious thorough & logical thinking; Appropriate manner – being calm, polite, no overreacting; Openness to experience, willing to try even uninterested task or topics.”

“I gave the student opportunity to talk to patient. She could communicate well and established rapport with patient discussing on issues of weight control.”

MBBS Year 1
Professionalism in Practice Programme
Professionalism Assessment by Preceptor

Student Name: ___________________________ Year of Study: __________
Date of Attendance: ____________________

Please give a rating based on how well the student met expectations for his/her year of study:
1= unacceptable 2= below expectations 3= met expectations 4= exceeded expectations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Punctuality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Appropriate dress and appearance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Showed interest, engaged</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Well prepared and took initiative for own learning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Sought feedback or advice for self-improvement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Communicated with appropriate language and behaviour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Showed respect for preceptor, patients and clinic staff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall impression</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Additional comments:

The student’s report on the visit will be sent to you for marking about 4-6 weeks following the visit. Please indicate how you would like to receive the student’s report:

By email ☐ By fax ☐ By post ☐
Assessment - Understanding

My Personal Medical Student Oath

As a year 1 medical student at the University of Hong Kong, and as a future physician,

I will work hard
to acquire the knowledge which may benefit my future patients. To do this, I will not study only for examination purposes but will also seek knowledge from various sources that can help me become a more knowledgeable physician.

I will be humble
and always acknowledge the fact that there are still many things for me to learn. To do this, I will be prepared to learn things that I am not familiar with and see learning as a lifelong process.

I will acknowledge
my limitations and be willing to ask for help from my teachers, fellow students and other members of the faculty when I need.

I will actively engage
in different activities inside and outside medical school which may help me prepare to become a better physician. These include attachment programmes, clinical visits, community services, etc.

I will admit
my mistakes when I make them, and learn from them afterwards so that I can avoid making them again in the future.

I will learn
the art side as well as the science side of medicine. To do this, I will learn to show the appropriate attitudes and behaviours when I face my patients, while learning the scientific knowledge of medicine.

Respectful (n=87)
Diligent (n=75)
Support (n=61)
Honest (n=58)
Equality (n=56)
Gratitude (n=53)
Responsible (n=51)
## Assessment and Feedback

### A. EFFORT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Below expectations</th>
<th>Meets expectations</th>
<th>Exceeds expectations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Little effort shown in completing the task</td>
<td>Satisfactory effort in completing the task with adequate attention to presentation of work</td>
<td>Good effort and interest in completing the task with care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some interest or effort in completing the task</td>
<td></td>
<td>Great interest, effort and pride demonstrated in completing the task with care</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### B. CONTENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Below expectations</th>
<th>Meets expectations</th>
<th>Exceeds expectations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The writing is superficial and unrelated to the prompting question</td>
<td>Responds to the prompt and shows some evidence that the preceptor visit triggered thinking about the topic</td>
<td>Responds fully to the prompt relating the observations of the visit to personal experiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does not fully respond to the prompt and is purely a description without reflection</td>
<td></td>
<td>Responds fully to the prompt, demonstrates insightful observations and reflection on how this relates to prior experience/ views</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**FEEDBACK COMMENTS TO STUDENT:**

Used examples much more clearly illustrate the various elements of professionalism.
Thank you!

juliechen@hku.hk